

# ANCHORAGE MUSEUM

## SHAAWATKE'É'S BIRTH: LANGUAGE, IDENTITY, AND ART

### ART OF THE NORTH GALLERY LESSON PLAN



Around the world, a language dies every 14 days. In Alaska, there are 20 officially recognized Alaska Native languages. The majority of these languages are critically endangered today. The Alaska Native Language Preservation and Advisory Council (ANLPAC) estimates that all Alaska Native languages may vanish by the end of the century. The last fluent speaker of the Eyak language, Chief Marie Smith Jones, died in 2008.

Language is embedded in our identity, culture and how we relate to our place and the people around us. Passed down from generation to generation, language carries and transmits traditions and ways of knowing. Despite the compelling statistic about linguistic extinction, languages can be powerful and resilient. Languages cross borders of nations and territories. And, many languages resist eras of assimilation and colonization. As developments in technology make global connection and communication easier, languages continue to dynamically change.

Anchorage, the largest city in Alaska, is located on the traditional homelands of the Eklutna Dena'ina ('Athabascan') people. The Eklutna Dena'ina are part of the largest Indigenous language family in North America, the *Dene* language family, which is commonly identified as 'Athabascan'—a word that is not native to any of the Indigenous languages to which it refers. In the Anchorage School District, about 99 languages besides English are spoken at home. The top 5 languages spoken in the city after English are: Spanish, Samoan, Hmong, Filipino, and Yup'ik.

This gallery lesson plan examines the relationship of language, culture, and identity through the poem 'Shaawatke'é's Birth' by Emily Wall and X'unei Lance Twitchell and works of art from the Anchorage Museum.

## KEY THEMES

---

- Language is connected to identity and culture
- Visual works of art and poems offer ways of knowing about the landscapes and peoples of Alaska into cultures

## KEY QUESTIONS

---

- How does the use of voice and language empower an individual?
- What is the relationship between language, identity, and culture?

## MATERIALS

---

- [Poem: Shaawatke'é's Birth by Emily Wall and X'unei Lance Twitchell](#)
- [Film: Shaawatke'é's Birth \[youtu.be/wHVrEBcEXFg\]](https://youtu.be/wHVrEBcEXFg)
- [20 Questions Deck](#)
- Paper
- Coloring materials

## RECOMMENDED GRADE LEVEL

---

- Ninth grade and up

## INQUIRY BASED METHODS AT THE ANCHORAGE MUSEUM

---

The Anchorage Museum uses an expanded inquiry-based approach based in constructivism (constructivist learning theory). Through facilitated conversations which may begin much like Visual Thinking Strategies (VTS), students are encouraged to bring their knowledge to look closely at an object or image. In addition to the VTS methodology, educators at the Anchorage Museum provide context and content. This may include information about an object's artist or maker, examination of materials, processes, or uses of an object as well as relevant cultural or historical information.

Examinations of objects create an open-ended dialogue. In dialogue, learner-driven questions and observations, and facilitator provided content drive the process of meaning making between all participants.

### CONSTRUCTIVISM

Constructivism is a learning theory referring to the idea that knowledge is individually and socially constructed by the learners themselves. The learner actively constructs meaning using sensory input rather than passively accept knowledge.

### VISUAL THINKING STRATEGIES

Visual Thinking Strategies, or VTS, is an approach to teaching from visual materials, typically paintings, drawings and photographs. Developed by museum educators Philip Yenawine and Abigail Housen, this approach to teaching and learning is a learner-centered methodology that seeks to support close looking and communication skills.

The VTS teaching methodology centers around three questions:

*What's going on in this picture?*

*What do you see that makes you say that?*

*What more can we find?*



Educators use these open-ended questions to engage students in examination of images. Content or 'answers' are not provided, rather learners construct meaning individually and together. Educators reflect back what students respond and help facilitate the conversation moving forward.

VTS has been applied across disciplines. Extensive research on the strategy has demonstrated that students participating in multi-visit programs to museums using VTS techniques generated significantly more instances of critical thinking skills, said more, and were more likely to provide evidence for their thinking.

**LEARN MORE** [vtshome.org](http://vtshome.org)

## WHAT IS VISUAL LITERACY?

We live in an increasingly visual world and fostering skills to decode today's visual world is more critical than ever. By looking closely at visual sources and works of art, students develop visual literacy, critical thinking, and communication skills.

*Visual literacy is a set of abilities that enables an individual to effectively find, interpret, evaluate, use, and create images and visual media. Visual literacy skills equip a learner to understand and analyze the contextual, cultural, ethical, aesthetic, intellectual, and technical components involved in the production and use of visual materials. A visually literate individual is both a critical consumer of visual media and a competent contributor to a body of shared knowledge and culture.*

- Association of College and Research Libraries

## TIPS FOR OBJECT-BASED TEACHING

---

### LOOK CLOSELY

Invite students to look closely for several minutes before sharing observations or beginning discussion. Take different perspectives: encourage getting up close and stepping back. Sketching or writing about what students see invites close looking and engages the students directly with the object.

### ASK OPEN-ENDED QUESTIONS

Invite students to share observations and what they notice from initial observations. In lieu of asking questions that have a right/wrong answer (ex *What color is it? When was this made? or How was this used?*) ask questions that allow students to bring critical and creative thinking to bear (ex *What colors do you notice? What materials do you see have been used to make this object? or What clues to how this object might be used to you observe?*).

### PROVIDE CONTENT

As questions or observations about an object arise in conversation, provide students with historical and cultural context or other relevant information. For example, if a student observes that a painting looks unfinished, you might share information that a painter was unable to complete his unfinished painting of Denali because his paints froze while painting *en plein air*.

### GET HANDS-ON

Drawing and writing support students in looking closely and thinking creatively and critically. Prompts might include:

- *Sketch a detail. Sketch the object from multiple perspectives.*
- [For paintings, drawings and photographs] *Sketch what you might imagine happened before this image. Sketch what you imagine might happen after.*
- [For objects] *Where do you imagine finding this object? Sketch an environment where this object might feel 'at home.' Sketch an environment where this object might feel 'out of place.'*
- *Write down a phrase that captures your emotion when you look at this work. Share with a partner. Are your reactions similar or different?*
- *Imagine the story behind the painting or photograph tells, or the story of how this object traveled from its original maker to the museum. Write a brief short story to capture your imaginings.*



# LANGUAGE, IDENTITY, AND ART

## PREPARATION EXPERIENCE

---

Suggested in-class activities to engage high school students and older with the themes of Shaawatke'é's Birth to prepare before your visit.

**ACTIVITY 1** Vertical Reading

---

**TIME FRAME** 30 minutes

---

**MATERIALS** Paper, writing materials

---

Invite students to form a reading group and choose one of the articles below to read together to learn more about cultural and language loss:

**PROMPT**

- ['A Native Village In Alaska Where The Past Is Key To The Future' by Melissa Block. NPR. June 2017.](#)
- ['Scrambling to Save a Dying Language in Metlakatla' by Steve Quinn. Alaska Daily Dispatch. February 7, 2017.](#)
- ['Vanishing Voices' by Russ Rymer. National Geographic. July 2012 issue.](#)
- ['What's Lost When A Language Dies' by Lane Wallace. The Atlantic. November 2009.](#)
- ['When A Language Dies, What Happens To Culture?' NPR. June 2013.](#)

Students may discuss the articles' themes, summarize, and share their findings with the class.

---

**ACTIVITY 2** Reflect and Pair Share

---

**TIME FRAME** 20+ minutes

---

**MATERIALS** Paper, writing materials

---

**READ** [Shaawatke'é's Birth](#) by Emily Wall and X'unei Lance Twitchell and watch the short film of poets reading their poem.

**PROMPT** 2 mins Invite students to individually reflect on the poem.  
5 mins Invite students to jot down their initial thoughts from earlier and write a summary of the poem.

**ACTIVITY 3** The Director's Chair

---

**TIME FRAME** 30+ minutes

---

**MATERIALS** Paper, writing materials

---

**READ** [Shaawatke'é's Birth](#) by Emily Wall and X'unei Lance Twitchell and watch the short film of poets reading their poem. Invite students to write a review of the film.

**PROMPT**

**CONSIDER** camera angles, lighting, costumes, and portrayal of speakers. *How do those choices influence your interpretation of the film?*



## IN GALLERY EXPERIENCE: RADIO BABIES

Engage students in the galleries with a close-looking activity.



George Aden Ahgupuk (1911-2001, American)

*Radio Babies*, c. 1940

Ink and watercolor on skin

1970.169.1

*Art of the North* galleries

George Aden Ahgupuk, also known as Twok, was an American artist of Iñupiat heritage born in the coastal village of Shishmaref in Alaska. He is best known for his drawings of hunting, villages, and landscapes—scenes of the traditional Iñupiat life—on the treated skins of seals, reindeer, and caribou that he grew up hunting.

After completing fourth grade, Ahgupuk withdrew from elementary school to help hunt and contribute food to the family. At the age of nineteen, on his way back

home after traveling to Nome with his uncle to see a dentist for an infected tooth, Ahgupuk slipped down a cliff and severely fractured his leg while hunting ptarmigan. Although his uncle had set the fractured bone, Ahgupuk's bone did not heal properly and pain continued. In 1934, at the urging of a traveling field nurse who examined his leg, Ahgupuk went to the Alaska Native Service Hospital in Kotzebue, about 169 kilometers away, where doctors diagnosed a tubercular bone infection from his earlier fracture. The doctors were able to avoid amputation with surgery but Ahgupuk would never be able to bend his knee. During his recovery period, Ahgupuk began drawing on toilet tissue—the only available drawing material in the hospital—with a burnt match as a pencil. Deciding to become a full-time artist, Ahgupuk first used bleached sealskins and continued to experiment with the bleaching process of various skins as an alternative drawing surface because he did not have access to traditional paper and drawing tools.

Pictured in *Radio Babies* is Joseph Romig, a well-known early doctor in Alaska and Mayor of Anchorage from 1937 to 1938, offering advice over the radio to an expectant mother in Bethel, Alaska. The baby soars over Rainy Pass on the airwaves to an antenna in Bethel where his parents anxiously await his arrival.

### CLOSE-LOOKING

Invite students to look closely, quietly at the object.

### OBSERVE

Invite students to share observations about the object.

**USE [20 Questions Deck](#)** for more group discussion questions about the object.

### DISCUSS

**QUESTION** *What is the relationship of the language (text) and imagery? What is the relationship of the artwork to culture?*

- [ahgupuk.com](http://ahgupuk.com)
- Jones, Suzi. *Eskimo Drawings*. Anchorage Museum, 2008.
- Anderson, Eva Greenslit. *Dog-Team Doctor: The Story of Dr. Romig*. Kessinger Publishing, 2010.

### LEARN MORE

## IN GALLERY EXPERIENCE: *UNTITLED*

Engage students in the galleries with a close-looking activity.

Tommy Joseph (b. 1964, American)

*Untitled*, c. 1997

Wood, paint

2012.12.23

*Art of the North* galleries



A teacher, interpreter, and Tlingit master carver, Tommy Joseph has been carving in Sitka since the 1980s and oversees the carving shop at the Southeast Alaska Indian Culture Center.

*Untitled* was carved from a length of Western red cedar, taken from the upper part of a tree that was approximately 900 years old. The pole has a carved human figure wearing a potlatch spruce root hat, with Raven positioned on top of a bentwood box with the sun—

referencing the ancient story of how Raven helped to bring the sun, moon, stars, fresh water, and fire to the world. Totem poles have long been a part of Tlingit culture with carving skills passed from generation to generation. Totems traditionally serve as a means to remember and declare clan status and heritage as well as represent events and legends. Tlingit society has a complex social structure and each familial clan is organized into two moieties, Eagle and Raven. Tlingit people are born into their identity, which is established through matrilineal bloodlines. Moiety membership may be demonstrated by Eagle or Raven crests. Clans also have their own distinct crests and symbols. These identifiers are used on clothing, adornment, household goods and on totem poles.

*Untitled* was commissioned by the Carr family who selected the design elements. Although the totem pole is painted of traditional Tlingit colors of black, red, and green/blue exterior latex paint, Joseph has stated it does not have a traditional meaning.

### CLOSE-LOOKING

Invite students to look closely, quietly at the object.

### OBSERVE

Invite students to share observations about the object.

Invite students to share their definitions of “culture” and “identity.”

[From Merriam-Webster]

**cul-ture** - *noun* - the characteristic features of everyday existence shared by people in a place or time; the integrated pattern of human knowledge, belief, and behavior that depends upon the capacity for learning and transmitting knowledge to succeeding generations; acquaintance with and taste in fine arts, humanities, and broad aspects of science as distinguished from vocational and technical skills

### DISCUSS

**i-den-ti-ty** - *noun* - the distinguishing character or personality of an individual

**USE [20 Questions Deck](#)** for more group discussion questions about the object.

**QUESTION** *What is the relationship of culture and identity in the artwork?*

- [tommy-joseph.blogspot.com](http://tommy-joseph.blogspot.com)
- [‘Sitka wood carver Tommy Joseph comes to the Anchorage Museum’ ADN. June 6, 2010.](#)
- [‘How the Raven Gave Us Light’ told by Shirley Kendall \(Eagle Moiety\). PBS Learning Media.](#)
- Patrick, Andrew. *The Most Striking of Objects: The Totem Poles of Sitka National Historical Park*. National Park Service, 2002.

### LEARN MORE



## IN GALLERY EXPERIENCE: I THINK IT GOES LIKE THIS?

Engage students in the galleries with a close-looking activity.



Nicholas Galanin (Yéil Ya-Tseen) (b. 1979, American)  
*I think it goes like this?* 2016  
Wood, paint, and metal  
2016.8.1  
*Art of the North* galleries

Artist Nicholas Galanin (Yéil Ya-Tseen) is of Tlingit and Unanga<sup>h</sup> heritage. He connects past to present and traditional to contemporary through his art practice. Galanin learned traditional methods of wood-carving, metal and stone-working from elders in his community and also trained at art schools in England and New Zealand. Galanin combines materials and processes that reflect his heritage with contemporary methods and forms to create work in a variety of media: jewelry, sculpture, installation, video, performance, and music. Through his interdisciplinary practice, Galanin examines the importance of claiming personal and cultural identities. Galanin preserves and passes on traditional knowledge and art forms while also expressing his individual perspective and creative approaches as a

contemporary artist. Galanin lives in his birthplace Sitka, Alaska working as an artist, musician, and arts instructor.

The sculpture *I think it goes like this?* is a totem pole, painted white and chopped into pieces which resemble firewood and arranged. Galanin purchased the Tlingit-style totem pole—created by an anonymous, non-Indigenous, Indonesian carver—from a wholesale market in Seattle. Similar styles of totem poles are made for tourists and sold in Alaska. These acts comment on the appropriative market of Northwest coast style art as non-Indigenous artists mimic and profit from Indigenous artworks and cultures in their attempt to make it their own. In *I think it goes like this?* Galanin emphasizes issues of cultural appropriation, the act of taking or using things from a culture that is not your own.

### CLOSE-LOOKING

Invite students to look closely, quietly at the object.

### OBSERVE

Invite students to share observations about the object.

USE [20 Questions Deck](#) for more group discussion questions about the object.

### PROMPT

**QUESTION** *What is the relationship of culture and identity in the artwork? How does 'I think it goes like this?' relate to Tommy Joseph's 'Untitled' totem pole?*

### LEARN MORE

- [galan.in](http://galan.in)
- "Interview with Nicholas Galanin, Episode 22." [Broken Boxes Podcast soundcloud.com/brokenboxes/interview-with-artist-nicholas-galanin](https://www.soundcloud.com/brokenboxes/interview-with-artist-nicholas-galanin)



## POST-VISIT EXPERIENCE

---

Discuss and reflect upon the experience with in-class activities after your visit.

<b>ACTIVITY 4</b>	Self-Portrait
<b>TIME FRAME</b>	30+ mins
<b>MATERIALS</b>	Paper, writing materials
	Select three aspects of your identity you want to share with the world. Create a self-portrait using those three terms.
<b>PROMPT</b>	<b>CONSIDER</b> <i>What key images, figures or symbols represent your themes? What words would you use?</i>
	Students may present their writing and artworks with the class.

<b>ACTIVITY 5</b>	Language and Identity
<b>TIME FRAME</b>	30+ mins
<b>MATERIALS</b>	Paper, writing, and art materials
	Invite students to think about the relationship of language and identity in the poem.
	Consider further how concepts of language and identity appear in the artworks above from the museum.
<b>PROMPT</b>	Using your evidences from the poem, the artworks and personal experience, write about the relationship of language and identity.
	Write a poem or prose text based on your personal experience exploring your identity and its relationship to language.
	<b>CONSIDER</b> <i>How would you respond to the poets in the poem?</i>
	Share with a friend, a family member or mentor.

“Culture cannot be contained as it unfolds. My art enters this stream at many different points, looking backwards, looking forwards, generating its own sound and motion. I am inspired by generations of Tlingit creativity and contribute to this wealthy conversation through active curiosity. There is no room in this exploration for the tired prescriptions of the “Indian Art World” and its institutions. Through creating I assert my freedom.”<sup>1</sup>

– Nicholas Galanin

<sup>1</sup> “Exploring the Artistic Worlds of Nicholas Galanin.” Indian Country Media Network. August 25, 2017. <https://indiancountrymedianetwork.com/travel/destinations/exploring-artistic-worlds-nicholas-galanin/>.

“The viewer, collector, or curators’ definition will often convey more about themselves than that of the “Native Artist.” In the past I have struggled with this title, though I now embrace my position as a contemporary indigenous artist with belief that some forms of resistance often carry equal amounts of persistence.”<sup>2</sup>

– Nicholas Galanin

<sup>2</sup> Galanin, Nicholas. “Nicholas Galanin.” Artists | Beat Nation – Hip Hop as Indigenous Culture. April 21, 2009. <http://www.beatnation.org/nicholas-galanin.html>.





## WEB RESOURCES

---

[onlinecollections.anchagemuseum.org](http://onlinecollections.anchagemuseum.org)

Collections - Anchorage Museum

[tlingitpoem.weebly.com](http://tlingitpoem.weebly.com)

'Shaawatke'é's Birth' Teaching Resources - AQR

[vilda.alaska.edu](http://vilda.alaska.edu)

Alaska's Digital Database - Vilda Database

[Engaging Students with Primary Sources](#)

Smithsonian National Museum of American History

[usdac.us/nativeland](http://usdac.us/nativeland)

Honor Native Land - U.S. Department of Arts and Culture

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

---

Books below are available at the Atwood Resource Center, Anchorage Museum and Anchorage Public Library.

Anderson, Eva Greenslit. *Dog-Team Doctor: The Story of Dr. Romig*. Kessinger Publishing, 2010.

Burnham, Rika and Elliott Kai-Kee. *Teaching in the Art Museum: Interpretation as Experience 1st Edition*. Los Angeles: J. Paul Getty Museum, 2011.

Elkins, James. *How to Use Your Eyes*. New York: Routledge, 2000.

Jones, Suzi. *Eskimo Drawings*. Anchorage Museum, 2008.

Patrick, Andrew. *The Most Striking of Objects: The Totem Poles of Sitka National Historical Park*. National Park Service, 2002.

Leborg, Christian. *Visual Grammar*. New York: Princeton Architectural Press, 2004.

Roderick, Libby. *Alaska Native Cultures and Issues Responses to Frequently Asked Questions*. University of Alaska Press, 2014.

Williams, Maria Shaa Tláa, editor. *The Alaska Native Reader: History, Culture, Politics*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2009.

Yenawine, Philip. *Visual Thinking Strategies: Using Art to Deepen Learning Across School Disciplines*. Cambridge: Harvard Education Press, 2013.

This lesson plan was adapted from the November 2017 educator workshop: *Shaawatke'é's Birth: Catalyzing Communication Across Cultural Difference* in the K-12 Classroom sponsored by The Alaska Quarterly Review and the Anchorage Museum.

For more teaching resources, visit [anchagemuseum.org/teachingresources](http://anchagemuseum.org/teachingresources)



## RELATED CONTENT AREAS

---

### ALASKA STANDARDS FOR CULTURALLY-RESPONSIVE STUDENTS

- B. 1. acquire insights from other cultures without diminishing the integrity of their own;
- B. 2. make effective use of the knowledge, skills and ways of knowing from their own cultural traditions to learn about the larger world in which they live
- E. 7. determine how cultural values and beliefs influence the interaction of people from different cultural backgrounds;
- E. 8. Identify and appreciate who they are and their place in the world.

### ALASKA STANDARDS FOR ALASKA HISTORY 9-12

AH.PPE 2 demonstrates an understanding of the interaction between people and their physical environment by: using texts/sources to analyze the similarities and differences in cultural attributes, movement, interactions, and settlement of Alaska Native peoples

AH.PPE 5 demonstrates an understanding of the interaction between people and their physical environment by: comparing and contrasting the different perspectives between rural and urban areas

### ALASKA STANDARDS FOR HISTORY 9-12

Hist.A5 understand that history is a narrative told in many voices and expresses various perspectives of historical experience

Hist.A6 know that cultural elements reflect the ideas and attitudes of a specific time and know how the cultural elements influence human interaction

Hist.A8 know that history is a bridge to understanding groups of people and an individual's relationship to society

Hist.A9 understand that history is a fundamental connection that unifies all fields of human understanding and endeavor

### ALASKA STANDARDS FOR VISUAL ARTS 9-12

VA:CN11a-HSP a. Describe how knowledge of culture, traditions, and history may influence personal responses to art.

VA:CN11a-HSAC a. Compare and connect contemporary and/or local art through the context of society, culture and history.

VA:RE7a-HSP a. Speculate and analyze ways in which art impacts people's perception and understanding of human experiences.

VA:RE7b-HSAD b. Identify commonalities in visual images made in the same era

### COMMON CORE STATE STANDARDS FOR 9-10 STUDENTS

English Language Arts & Literacy In History/Social Studies, Science, And Technical Subjects

#### Key Ideas and Details

- 2. Determine a theme or central idea of a text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.

#### Integration of Knowledge and Ideas

- 7. Analyze the representation of a subject or a key scene in two different artistic mediums, including what is emphasized or absent in each treatment.

#### WRITING 9-10

##### Text Types and Purposes

- 1. Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

##### Production and Distribution of Writing

- 4. Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

##### Research to Build and Present Knowledge

- 7. Conduct short as well as more sustained research projects to answer a question (including a self-generated question) or solve a problem; narrow or broaden the inquiry when appropriate; synthesize multiple sources on the subject, demonstrating understanding of the subject under investigation.

#### SPEAKING AND LISTENING 9-10

##### Comprehension and Collaboration

- 1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9-10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.
  - a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas.



c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that relate the current discussion to broader themes or larger ideas; actively incorporate others into the discussion; and clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions.

d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, summarize points of agreement and disagreement, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views and understanding and make new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning presented

#### COMMON CORE STATE STANDARDS FOR 11-12 STUDENTS

#### English Language Arts & Literacy In History/Social Studies, Science, And Technical Subjects

##### Key Ideas and Details

2. Determine two or more themes or central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to produce a complex account; provide an objective summary of the text.

##### Craft and Structure

6. Analyze a case in which grasping point of view requires distinguishing what is directly stated in a text from what is really meant (e.g., satire, sarcasm, irony, or understatement).

##### Integration of Knowledge and Ideas

7. Analyze multiple interpretations of a story, drama, or poem (e.g., recorded or live production of a play or recorded novel or poetry), evaluating how each version interprets the source text.

#### WRITING 11-12

##### Text Types and Purposes

1. Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

##### Production and Distribution of Writing

4. Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

#### SPEAKING AND LISTENING 11-12

##### Comprehension and Collaboration

1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 11-12 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas.

c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that relate the current discussion to broader themes or larger ideas; actively incorporate others into the discussion; and clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions.

d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, summarize points of agreement and disagreement, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views and understanding and make new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning presented

